

Comment Letter of a Bi-Partisan Group of  
Eighty Professors of Law, Business, Economics, or Finance  
in Favor of Facilitating Shareholder Director Nominations

August 17, 2009

VIA E-MAIL: rule-comments@sec.gov

Ms. Elizabeth M. Murphy  
Secretary  
U.S. Securities and Exchange Commission  
100 F Street, NE  
Washington, DC 20549-1090

Re: File No. S7-10-09  
Release No. 34-60089  
Facilitating Shareholder Director Nominations

Dear Ms. Murphy:

This comment letter is submitted on behalf of a bi-partisan group of eighty professors of law, business, economics, or finance whose names appear below (the “Submitting Professors”). The Submitting Professors are affiliated with forty-seven universities around the United States.<sup>1</sup> All of the Submitting Professors have research or professional interests relating to how publicly traded firms are run and how their affairs are governed by corporate and securities laws. The Submitting Professors welcome the opportunity to provide comments to the Securities and Exchange Commission (the “SEC”) on its proposed rule *Facilitating Shareholder Director Nominations* (the “Proposed Rule”).

There is substantial variance among the views of the Submitting Professors on many corporate governance matters. However, all of the Submitting Professors support the SEC’s proposals to remove impediments to the exercise of shareholders’ rights to nominate and elect directors and to enable shareholders to place proposals regarding nomination and election procedures on the corporate ballot. All of the Submitting Professors urge the SEC to adopt a final rule based on the SEC’s current proposals, and to do so without adopting modifications that could dilute the value of the rule to public investors. While all of the Submitting Professors share the views expressed in this paragraph, each individual professor may not endorse each and every statement below.

---

<sup>1</sup> The Submitting Professors submit this comment letter in their individual, not institutional, capacities; institutional affiliations are listed below for identification purposes only.

The ability of shareholders to replace directors is supposed to play a key role in the governance structure of public companies. However, shareholders seeking to replace directors face considerable impediments. One significant impediment to replacing directors is incumbents' control of the company's proxy card – the corporate ballot sent by the company at its expense to all shareholders. We believe that providing shareholders with rights to place director candidates on the company's proxy card, as the SEC proposes doing, would improve director accountability.

Providing shareholders with minimum rights of access to the company's proxy card, and allowing companies to provide shareholders with additional rights but not to take away the set minimum, is consistent with the long-standing and established role of the proxy rules (and the securities laws in general) and the division of labor between them and state corporate law. The proxy rules (and the securities laws in general) have long provided mandatory arrangements establishing a minimum level of protection for public investors, with companies being free to add additional protections but not to reduce investors' protections below the established minimum.

We also believe that incumbent directors should not have an effective monopoly power to set the corporate arrangements governing their own election, and that it is therefore desirable to facilitate shareholders' ability to amend – within the limits set by state and federal law – corporate arrangements governing the nomination and election of directors. Accordingly, we support the SEC's proposal to amend Rule 14a-11 to enable shareholders to place proposals related to such arrangements on the corporate ballot.

In designing the final rule, the SEC should be careful to avoid eligibility or procedural requirements that would undermine or unnecessarily detract from the Proposed Rule's value for investors. In evaluating these requirements, it is important to keep in mind that, no matter how moderate eligibility or procedural requirements may be, shareholder nominees must still meet the demanding test of getting elected before they can join the board. A shareholder nominee will join the board only if the nominee obtains more votes than the incumbents' candidate in an election in which incumbents, but not the shareholder nominee or the nominator, may spend significant amounts of the company's resources on campaign expenses.

In evaluating eligibility and procedural requirements, the SEC should also keep in mind that many institutional investors lack incentives to invest actively in seeking governance benefits that would be shared by their fellow shareholders. Accordingly, the final design of the rule should avoid imposing any unnecessary hurdles or costs on shareholders organizing or joining a nominating group.

The SEC was authorized by Congress to prescribe rules to regulate the use of proxies “as necessary or appropriate in the public interest or for the protection of investors.” Adopting the SEC’s proposals, while ensuring that the final rule does not impose eligibility or procedural requirements that would dilute its value for investors, will advance the public interest and the protection of investors.

—

In case we could be useful in any way to the deliberations of the staff or the Commission on this subject, please contact Lucian Bebchuk at (617) 495-3138 or at [bebchuk@law.harvard.edu](mailto:bebchuk@law.harvard.edu).

Sincerely yours,



---

Professor Lucian A. Bebchuk

cc: Chairwoman Mary L. Schapiro  
Commissioner Luis A. Aguilar  
Commissioner Kathleen L. Casey  
Commissioner Troy A. Paredes  
Commissioner Elisse B. Walter  
Division of Corporation Finance Director Meredith B. Cross

List of Eighty Professors of Law, Business, Economics, or Finance  
on Behalf of Whom this Comment Letter is Filed:

Michael Adler  
Professor of Finance & Economics  
Columbia University Business School

Jonathan GS Koppell  
Associate Professor of Politics and Management  
Yale School of Management

Robert Ashford  
Professor of Law  
Syracuse University College of Law

Donald C. Langevoort  
Thomas Aquinas Reynolds Professor of Law  
Georgetown University Law Center

Steven Balsam  
Professor of Accounting  
Fox School of Business and Management  
Temple University

Lucian A. Bebchuk  
William J. Friedman and Alicia Townsend  
Friedman Professor of Law,  
Economics, and Finance  
Director of the Program on Corporate Governance  
Harvard Law School

Lisa Bernstein  
Wilson Dickenson Professor of Law  
The University of Chicago

Sanjai Bhagat  
Professor of Finance  
Director, Leeds Ph.D. Program  
Founding Director, Burrige Center for Valuation  
Leeds School of Business  
University of Colorado

Leonard Bierman  
Professor  
Mays Business School  
Texas A&M University

Bernard S. Black  
Professor of Law  
The University of Texas Law School

Michael Bradley  
F.M. Kirby Professor of Investment Banking  
Fuqua School of Business  
Professor of Law  
Duke University

J. Robert Brown, Jr.  
Professor  
University of Denver Sturm College of Law

Michael E. Levine  
Distinguished Research Scholar  
Senior Lecturer  
New York University School of Law

Ross Levine  
James and Merryl Tisch Professor of Economics  
Director, William R. Rhodes Center for International  
Economics and Finance  
Brown University

Karl V. Lins  
R. Thayne Robson Faculty Fellow  
Professor of Finance  
David Eccles School of Business  
University of Utah

Katherine Litvak  
Professor of Law  
Northwestern University School of Law

Dennis E. Logue  
Steven Roth Professor Emeritus  
Tuck School  
Dartmouth College

Stephen Marks  
Professor of Law  
Boston University School of Law

Ronald W. Masulis  
Frank K. Houston Professor of Finance  
Professor of Law  
Vanderbilt University

Todd Milbourn  
Professor of Finance  
Finance Area Coordinator  
Olin Business School  
Washington University

Lawrence D. Brown  
J. Mack Robinson Distinguished Professor  
of Accountancy  
Georgia State University School of Accountancy

Richard Buxbaum  
J.D. Program and Jackson H. Ralston Professor  
of International Law  
Boalt Hall  
University of California at Berkeley

David C. Cicero  
Assistant Professor of Finance  
Lerner College of Business and Economics  
University of Delaware

Jim Cox  
Brainerd Currie Professor of Law  
Duke Law School

Martijn Cremers  
Associate Professor of Finance  
Yale School of Management

Lawrence A. Cunningham  
Henry St. George Tucker III Research Professor  
George Washington University

Lynne L. Dallas  
Professor of Law  
University of San Diego School of Law

Steven M. Davidoff  
Associate Professor of Law  
University of Connecticut School of Law

George W. Dent  
Schott-van den Eynden Professor  
Case Western Reserve University School of Law

Dale Oesterle  
J. Gilbert Reese Chair in Contract Law  
Moritz School of Law  
Ohio State University

Richard W. Painter  
S. Walter Richey Professor of Corporate Law  
University of Minnesota Law School

Arthur R. Pinto  
Professor of Law  
Co-Director Dennis J. Block Center for the Study of  
International Business Law  
Brooklyn Law School

Katharina Pistor  
Michael I. Sovern Professor of Law  
Columbia Law School

Robert A. Ragazzo  
University of Houston Law  
Foundation Professor of Law  
University of Houston Law Center

Jay R. Ritter  
Cordell Professor of Finance  
University of Florida

Len Rosenthal  
Professor of Finance  
Bentley University

Ronald D. Rotunda  
Doy and Dee Henley Chair and Distinguished  
Professor of Jurisprudence  
Chapman University School of Law

Malcolm S. Salter  
James J. Hill Professor, Emeritus  
Harvard University  
Graduate School of Business Administration

B. Espen Eckbo  
Tuck Centennial Chair in Finance  
Founder, Lindenauer Center for  
Corporate Governance  
Tuck School of Business  
Dartmouth College

Antoinette Schoar  
Michael Koerner '49 Professor of  
Entrepreneurial Finance  
MIT Sloan School of Management

Aaron Edlin  
Richard Jennings Professor of Law and Professor  
of Economics  
University of California at Berkeley

Kenneth Scott  
Ralph M. Parsons Professor of  
Law and Business, Emeritus  
Stanford Law School

Franklin R. Edwards  
Arthur F. Burns Professor of Free and  
Competitive Enterprise  
Columbia Business School

Robert J. Shiller  
Arthur M. Okun Professor of Economics  
Yale University

Lisa M. Fairfax  
Leroy Sorenson Merrifield Research  
Professor of Law  
The George Washington University Law School

Stanley Siegel  
Professor of Law  
New York University School of Law

Olubunmi Faleye  
Associate Professor of Finance  
Lloyd Mullin Research Fellow  
Northeastern University

D. Gordon Smith  
Associate Dean for Faculty and Curriculum  
Glen L. Farr Professor of Law  
J. Reuben Clark Law School  
Brigham Young University

James Fanto  
Professor of Law  
Brooklyn Law School

Jeffrey Sonnenfeld  
Lester Crown Professor of Management Practice  
Yale School of Management

Fabrizio Ferri  
Assistant Professor  
Harvard Business School

Marc I. Steinberg  
Senior Associate Dean for Research  
Rupert and Lillian Radford Professor of Law  
SMU Dedman School of Law

Jill E. Fisch  
Perry Golkin Professor of Law  
University of Pennsylvania Law School

Shyam Sunder  
James L. Frank Professor of Accounting,  
Economics and Finance  
Yale School of Management

Tamar Frankel  
Professor of Law  
Michaels Faculty Research Scholar  
Boston University Law School

Eric Talley  
Professor of Law  
Faculty Co-Director, Berkeley Center for Law,  
Business and the Economy  
Boalt Hall  
University of California at Berkeley

Jesse Fried  
Professor of Law  
Harvard Law School

Anjan Thakor  
John E. Simon Professor of Finance  
Senior Associate Dean-Programs  
Olin School of Business  
Washington University

Nicholas L. Georgakopoulos  
H.R. Woodard Professor of Law  
Indiana University School of Law – Indianapolis

Samuel C. Thompson, Jr.  
Professor of Law  
Arthur Weiss Distinguished Faculty Scholar  
Director, Center for the Study of  
Mergers and Acquisitions  
Dickinson School of Law  
The Pennsylvania State University

Ronald J. Gilson  
Meyers Professor of Law and Business  
Stanford Law School

Belén Villalonga  
Associate Professor  
Harvard Business School

Henry Hansmann  
Augustus E. Lines Professor of Law  
Yale Law School

William K.S. Wang  
Professor of Law  
University of California, Hastings

Jay C. Hartzell  
Associate Professor of Finance  
Allied Bancshares Centennial Fellow  
McCombs School of Business  
The University of Texas at Austin

Mark Weinstein  
Associate Professor of Finance and  
Business Economics  
Marshall School of Business  
Associate Professor of Business and Law  
Gould School of Law  
University of Southern California

Claire Hill  
Professor and Solly Robins Distinguished  
Research Fellow  
University of Minnesota Law School

Michael S. Weisbach  
Professor and Ralph W. Kurtz Chair in Finance  
The Ohio State University

Michael C. Jensen  
Jesse Isidor Straus Professor of Business  
Administration Emeritus  
Harvard Business School

Elliott J. Weiss  
Charles E. Ares Professor of Law Emeritus  
University of Arizona

Kose John  
Charles William Gerstenberg Professor of  
Banking and Finance  
Leonard M. Stern School of Business  
New York University

Ehud Kamar  
Professor of Law  
Gould School of Law  
University of Southern California

Naveen Khanna  
AJ Pasant Endowed Chair Professor of Finance  
Broad College of Business  
Michigan State University

Vikramaditya S. Khanna  
Professor of Law  
University of Michigan Law School

Bruce Kogut  
Sanford C. Bernstein & Co. Professor of  
Leadership and Ethics  
Columbia Business School

Ivo Welch  
CV Starr Professor of Economics (Finance)  
Brown University

Lawrence J. White  
Professor of Economics  
Stern School of Business  
New York University

Charles K. Whitehead  
Associate Professor of Law  
Cornell University Law School

Luigi Zingales  
Robert C. McCormack Professor of  
Entrepreneurship and Finance  
Booth School of Business  
The University of Chicago

Eric Zitzewitz  
Associate Professor of Economics  
Dartmouth College